

TRANSPORT AND WORKS ACT 1992

**TRANSPORT AND WORKS (INQUIRIES
PROCEDURE) RULES 2004**

**THE NETWORK RAIL
(ESSEX AND OTHERS LEVEL CROSSING
REDUCTION)
ORDER**

SUMMARY

PROOF OF EVIDENCE

-OF-

SUSAN TILBROOK

Document Reference	NR32/3
--------------------	--------

1 Qualifications, Experience and Role

- 1.1 I am Susan Tilbrook, a Projects Director with Mott MacDonald, which is a major engineering, management and development consultancy.
- 1.2 My qualifications include a BEng(hons) in Civil and Structural Engineering from the University of Sheffield and I am a member of the Chartered Institution of Highways and Transportation.
- 1.3 I have 28 years' experience in the planning, design and construction of transport infrastructure projects. This has included working in the highways team of a Local Authority for 10 years and within the Road Safety team of the same Local Authority for 2 years. During this time I was responsible for designing and supervising the construction of new highways, the design of major and minor highway improvements and road safety schemes. I also carried out Road Safety Audits as part of my role within the Road Safety team.
- 1.4 I am Mott MacDonald's design lead for our inputs to the project and am the designated Contractor's Engineering Manager (CEM) for the project, which means that I have overall accountability for all engineering activities included within Mott MacDonald's scope of work on this project. Mott MacDonald's role on the project has included:
- a. Development and assessment of options for alternative rights of way required in order to close level crossings
 - b. Diversity Impact Assessments (DIA)
 - c. Environmental assessments
 - d. Public and stakeholder consultation
- 1.5 My evidence will primarily address (a) above. I also make reference to points (b) to (d) where relevant, although I would note that I am not an expert witness on environmental or DIA assessments (those assessments were carried out by other teams within Mott MacDonald), and that public and stakeholder consultation is addressed in more detail in the Proofs of Evidence of Andrew Kenning and Nigel Billingsley.
- 1.6 I have been involved with the Anglia Level Crossings Closure Project since 2015 when our first commission commenced. I therefore have a close understanding of the how and why the alternative routes have developed into the final TWAO proposals and the constraints, considerations and views that have been taken into account during the process.

2 Overview

- 2.1 My evidence concerns the development of proposed alternatives for each crossing and I first set out the general approach to option identification and assessment together with reference to relevant standards and guidance. I then address the following on a crossing by crossing basis:
- a. Purpose and characteristics of the route being closed, extinguished or amended
 - b. Selection of alternative of the diversionary route or rights
 - c. Any alternatives considered
 - d. How the alternative or diversionary route fulfils the purpose of the original route and the relationship to the wider PROW network (where applicable)
 - e. If route includes road walking, how safe that route is and any necessary mitigation measures proposed
 - f. Engagement with the local Highway Authority (HA) and any changes made in response to HA comments or other consultation responses

- g. Consideration of any alternatives proposed by objectors to the Order
- h. Whether the proposed route is suitable and convenient

3 General

- 3.1 These proposals have been made as part of a Transport and Works Act Order Application.
- 3.2 Section 5(6) of the Transport and Works Act states that an order shall not extinguish a public right of way over land unless the Secretary of State is satisfied that an alternative right of way has been or will be provided, or that one is not required. If an alternative is to be provided, the Secretary of State would wish to be satisfied that it will be a convenient and suitable replacement for existing users. This is the basis on which alternative routes have been identified and assessed.
- 3.3 It should be noted that this is not an application under the Highways Act 1980, under which any proposed diversion must be suitable and it must also take into account 'public enjoyment of the footpath as a whole'. This is a different statutory test to that under s.5(6) of the Transport and Works Act 1992.
- 3.4 In section 1.4 of my proof of evidence, I briefly describe The Anglia Level Crossing Reduction Strategy (The Strategy) and explain that Mott MacDonald's commission only relates to Phases 1 and 2 of The Strategy. The Strategy is specifically dealt with by Ms Eliane Algaard in her Proof of Evidence, document number **NR28/1**.
- 3.5 In sections 1.5 and 1.6 of my proof of evidence, I go on to describe the work carried out by Mott MacDonald to assess the concept options identified by Network Rail and give details specifically about how the following factors were considered:
- a. Changes to rights of way and crossing rights
 - b. Level Crossing information (current rights/infrastructure)
 - c. Diversity Impact Assessment (DIA)
 - d. Land Ownership and use
 - e. Safety
 - f. Environmental issues
 - g. Costing of the proposals and maintenance liability
 - h. Stakeholder consultation
- 3.6 As a result of the assessment of the concept solutions, recommendations were made as follows:
- a. The concept solution is viable and can be taken forward for development.
 - b. The concept solution has some areas of concern and an alternative option has been identified that should be progressed in parallel.
 - c. The concept solution has some areas of concern and is not suitable for progressing. An alternative solution has been identified that should be progressed.
 - d. The concept solution has some areas of concern and is not suitable for progressing. No suitable alternative has been identified and the level crossing closure should be considered in a later phase of the strategy.
- 3.7 In section 1.7 of my evidence I describe the work carried out develop the proposed solutions to allow the preparation of a Transport and Works Act Order Application. This work required the

designs to be developed to sufficient detail to establish the rights and any land required to deliver the project.

- 3.8 As part of the development of the alternative routes for each crossing the following activities were carried out:
- a. Collection of further level crossing census data
 - b. Collection of traffic data where appropriate
 - c. Support to Network Rail during 2 rounds of public consultation and a further round of public engagement for selected crossings.
 - d. Support to Network Rail during consultation with Stakeholders
 - e. Assessment of the suitability and convenience of the proposed route
 - f. Environmental assessment of the impact of the proposals and preparation of an environmental screening request
 - g. An appraisal of the options considered for each level crossing closure proposal.
 - h. Outline design of infrastructure requirements
 - i. Road Safety Audits
 - j. Diversity Impact Assessments
- 3.9 In section 1.8 of my evidence I explain how the census surveys were carried out and how the information collected was assessed to give the design team an understanding of the numbers and purpose of usage of each level crossing. I also explain why traffic data was collected in some locations in Section 1.8
- 3.10 I briefly explain the support that Mott MacDonald gave Network Rail through the public consultation process and how feedback was collected and used in the assessment of options in Section 1.9 of my evidence.
- 3.11 I also set out the key stakeholders who were consulted with regarding the project and how their views fed into option development. These included the following organisations:
- a. Essex County Council
 - b. Hertfordshire County Council
 - c. London Borough of Havering
 - d. Southend-on-Sea Borough Council
 - e. Thurrock Borough Council
 - f. District, Parish and Community Councils
 - g. Members of Parliament
 - h. Schedules 5 and 6 consultees
 - i. Landowners
 - j. Local user and interest groups
- 3.12 My evidence with regard to key stakeholders can be found in Section 1.10 of my proof. Landowner engagement is specifically dealt with by Mr Nigel Billingsley in his Proof of Evidence.
- 3.13 I describe the assessment work carried out to understand the suitability and convenience of the proposed alternative routes in Section 1.11 of my proof of evidence. This assessment includes using information from surveys, public consultation, stakeholder engagement and a study of the

existing PROW network to gain a better understanding of the level and purpose of use of the routes that would be affected by the level crossing closures.

- 3.14 In section 1.12 I summarise the work undertaken to prepare and submit an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Screening Request to DfT on 31 January 2017 and confirm that on 15th March 2017 the Secretary of State issued a screening decision which confirmed that the project would be unlikely to have a significant effect on the environment and that an Environmental Impact Assessment was not required to support the Network Rail (Essex & Others Level Crossing Reduction) Order.
- 3.15 I describe how the proposal options were appraised in a consistent manner throughout the assessment process in section 1.13 of my evidence, and how the appraisal fed into the decision making process.
- 3.16 Section 1.14 of my evidence discusses design principles and the infrastructure requirements that have fed into the design freeze proposals.
- 3.17 In section 1.15 I set out the Road Safety Audit (RSA) process and explain how and why it has been applied to this project. I describe any particular RSA issues raised during the design process within each relevant crossing specific evidence.
- 3.18 I describe the work carried out to assist Network Rail in complying with their Public Sector equality duty under the Equality Act in section 1.16. This has been carried out through a Diversity Impact Assessment scoping study and full DIAs where considered necessary. I describe any particular DIA issues raised and how they were mitigated in my crossing specific evidence.

4 Crossing Specific Details

Reference	Level Crossing Name	
E01	Old Lane	My evidence for Old Lane Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.1 on page 16 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E02	Camps	My evidence for Camps Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.2 on page 17 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E04	Parndon Mill	My evidence for Parndon Mill Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.3 on page 20 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E05	Fullers End	My evidence for Fullers End Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.4 on page 22 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E06	Elsenham Emergency Hut	My evidence for Elsenham Emergency Hut Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.5 on page 25 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E07	Ugley Lane	My evidence for Ugley Lane Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.6 on page 26 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E08	Henham	My evidence for Henham Lane Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.7 on page 27 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E09	Elephant	My evidence for Elephant Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.8 on page 28 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E10	Dixies	My evidence for Dixies Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.9 on page 31 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E11	Windmills	My evidence for Windmills Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.10 on page 33 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1

Reference	Level Crossing Name	
E12	Wallaces	My evidence for Wallaces Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.11 on page 35 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E13	Littlebury Gatehouse	My evidence for Littlebury Gatehouse Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.12 on page 36 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E15	Parsonage Lane / Margaretting	My evidence for Parsonage Lane / Mararetting Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.13 on page 38 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E16	Maldon Road	My evidence for Maldon Road Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.14 on page 40 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E17	Boreham	My evidence for Boreham Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.15 on page 41 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E18	Noakes	My evidence for Noakes Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.15 on page 41 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E19	Potters	My evidence for Potters Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.16 on page 43 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E20	Snivillers	My evidence for Snivillers Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.17 on page 44 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E21	Hill House 1	My evidence for Hill House 1 Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.18 on page 46 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E22	Great Domsey	My evidence for Great Domsey Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.19 on page 48 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E23	Long Green	My evidence for Long Green Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.20 on page 49 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E25	Church 2	My evidence for Church 2 Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.21 on page 50 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E26	Barbara Close	My evidence for Barbara Close Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.22 on page 52 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E28	Whipps Farmers	My evidence for Whipps Farmers Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.23 on page 53 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E29	Brown and Tawse	My evidence for Brown and Tawse Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.24 on page 56 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E30	Ferry	My evidence for Ferry Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.25 on page 58 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E31	Brickyard Farm	My evidence for Brickyard Farm Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.25 on page 58 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E32	Woodgrange Close	My evidence for Woodgrange Close Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.26 on page 62 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E33	Motorbike	My evidence for Motorbike Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.27 on page 63 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E35	Cranes No. 1	My evidence for Cranes No. 1 Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.28 on page 65 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E36	Cranes No. 2	My evidence for Old Lane Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.29 on page 66 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E37	Essex Way	My evidence for Essex Way Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.30 on page 67 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E38	Battlesbridge	My evidence for Battlesbridge Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.31 on page 69 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E41	Paget	My evidence for Paget Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.32 on page 71 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E43	High Elm	My evidence for High Elm Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.34 on page 74 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E45	Great Bentley Station	My evidence for Great Bentley Station Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.35 on page 76 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E46	Lords No. 1	My evidence for Lords No. 1 Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.35 on page 76 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1

Reference	Level Crossing Name	
E47	Bluehouse	My evidence for Bluehouse Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.36 on page 78 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E48	Wheatsheaf	My evidence for Wheatsheaf Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.37 on page 80 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E49	Maria Street	My evidence for Maria Street Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.38 on page 82 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E51	Thornfield Wood	My evidence for Thornfield Wood Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.39 on page 84 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E52	Golden Square	My evidence for Golden Square Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.40 on page 86 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E54	Bures	My evidence for Bures Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.41 on page 88 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E56	Abbotts	My evidence for Abbotts Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.42 on page 90 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
E57	Wivenhoe Park	My evidence for Wivenhoe Park Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.43 on page 92 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
H01	Trinity Lane	My evidence for Trinity Lane Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.44 on page 95 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
H02	Cadmore Lane	My evidence for Cadmore Lane Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.45 on page 96 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
H03	Slip Lane	My evidence for Slip Lane Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.46 on page 97 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
H04	Tednambury	My evidence for Tednambury Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.47 on page 98 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
H05	Patterns	My evidence for Patterns Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.48 on page 99 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
H06	Gilston	My evidence for Gilston Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.48 on page 99 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
H08	Johnsons	My evidence for Johnsons Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.49 on page 102 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
H09	Fowlers	My evidence for Fowlers Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.48 on page 99 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
HA1	Butts Lane	My evidence for Butts Lane Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.50 on page 103 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
HA2	Woodhall Crescent	My evidence for Woodhall Crescent Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.51 on page 105 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
HA3	Manor Farm	My evidence for Manor Farm Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.52 on page 107 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
HA4	Eve's	My evidence for Eve's Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.52 on page 107 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
T01	No 131	My evidence for No 131 Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.53 on page 109 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
T04	Jefferies	My evidence for Jefferies Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.54 on page 110 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1
T05	Howells Farm	My evidence for Howells Farm Level Crossing can be found in Section 2.55 on page 113 of my Proof of Evidence NR32/1