SUPPLEMENTARY NOTE ON FLOOD HAZARD RATINGS AND THRESHOLDS FOR DEVELOPMENT PLANNING AND CONTROL PURPOSE – Clarification of the Table 13.1 of FD2320/TR2 and Figure 3.2 of FD2321/TR1.

Suresh Surendran and Geoff Gibbs (Environment Agency),
Steven Wade and Helen Udale-Clarke (HR Wallingford)
May 2008

Introduction

This document is a supplementary note to reconcile information provided in the 'Flood Risks to People Methodology' (FD2321/TR1[1]) and the 'Framework and Guidance for Assessing and Managing Flood Risk for New Development' (FD2320/TR2[2]) reports about the Flood Hazard Rating. It has been produced because both PPS25 in England and TAN15 in Wales require that people should be appropriately safe around new development. The document emphasises that for FRAs and FCAs at all levels to inform development allocations and proposals the simplified approach of FD2320 with regard to flood hazard rating should be used rather than the approach in FD2321. Although the final version of FD2321/TR1 post-dates FD2320/TR2, the work presented actually pre-dates the guidance in FD2320/TR2. This supplementary guidance is issued for those involved in development planning and control and to clarify the detail or difference of the Table 13.1 of FD2320/TR2 and Figure 3.2 of FD2321/TR1.

FD2321/TR1 was a research project based on the detailed literature review and analysis of empirical evidence related to flood hazard, derived mainly from theoretical assumptions and some basic laboratory experiments. Factors that affected flood hazard and vulnerability were combined in a form of multi-criteria analysis that was be used to identify the hot-spots and broadly estimate the probability of people seriously harmed and fatalities during the event of a flood. The multi-criteria method was calibrated to actual events, validated using data from seven flood events and shown to work well. The FD2321 (Risk to people) methodology illustrates the fundamental concepts and demonstrate how the approach could be used for different applications - it did not set a policy for flood hazard thresholds.

(Nevertheless there are a number of assumptions used in the FD2321 methodology, particularly with respect to the impact of debris and people's behaviour during flood events. There is a requirement for further research to collate more evidence on flood hazard, particularly the impacts of debris, and vulnerability in order to refine assumptions made in the flood hazard calculations, flood hazard thresholds and risks to people guidance. The study recommend more laboratory and field based tests on the impact of physical water quality aspect such as debris, mudflow; chemical and biological water quality that cause seriously harm or fatalities to people.)

[1] Defra and Agency (2006) *The Flood Risks to People Methodology*, Flood Risks to People Phase 2, FD2321 Technical Report 1, HR Wallingford et al. did the report for Defra/EA Flood and Coastal Defence R&D Programme, March 2006.
(http://sciencesearch.defra.gov.uk/Document.aspx?Document=FD2321_3436_TRP.pdf)
[2] Defra and Agency (2005) *Framework and Guidance for Assessing and Managing Flood Risk for New Development*, Flood Risk Assessment Guidance for New Development, FD2320 Technical Report 2, HR Wallingford et al. did the report for Defra/EA Flood and Coastal Defence R&D Programme, October 2005.
(http://sciencesearch.defra.gov.uk/Document.aspx?Document=FD2320_3364_TRP.pdf)

FD2320/TR2 (FRA guidance for new development) provides guidance that is a specific interpretation of the methodology developed under FD2321, within the context of development planning and control. Based on FD2320 consultation workshops, the project board (key users and experts) advised the project team to provide a simple methodology. Due uncertainties and limitations related to estimating risks to people, FD2320 adopted a precautionary approach, particularly with respect to the selection of debris factors and flood hazard thresholds

Risk to People (Ninj)

Ninj = **Nz** x **Flood Hazard Rating** x **Area Vulnerability** x **People Vulnerability**

where,

Ninj (Risk to People) = number of injuries within a particular hazard 'zone';
Nz = number of people within the hazard zone (at ground/basement level);
Flood Hazard Rating = HR = function of flood depth/velocity (within the hazard zone being considered) and debris factor;
Area Vulnerability = function of effectiveness of flood warning, speed of onset of flooding and nature of area (including types of buildings); and
People Vulnerability = function of presence of people who are very old and/or infirm/disabled/long-term sick

Flood Hazard Rating (HR) and thresholds

The revised 'hazard rating' expression based primarily, on consideration to the direct risks of people exposed to floodwaters.

HR = **d** x (**v** + **n**) + **DF**

where, HR = (flood) hazard rating;
d = depth of flooding (m);
v = velocity of floodwaters (m/sec); and
DF = debris factor (0, 0.5, 1 depending on probability that debris will lead to a hazard)
n = a constant of 0.5

This final revised Flood Hazard Rating formula from the Flood Risks to People project is presented on page 10 (section 3.5) of FD2321/TR1. The formula is identical in both FD2320 and FD2321 reports.

Based on Table 3.2 of FD2321, the Figure 3.2 of FD2321 illustrates the "Hazard to People Classifications" as a function of depth, velocity and debris factor. Such categorisation and the look-up table with flood hazard threshold could be useful for a range of application as an initial indication of Risks to People.

In this case (Figure 3.2 of FD2321) the calculation takes a debris factor as zero (**HR** = **d** x (**v** + **0.5**) + **0**).

However FD2321 strongly recommends the use of the debris factor and the formulas described in the Guidance Document for further calculation. The Table 3.1 of FD2321/TR1 (Table 1 of this note) suggests appropriate debris factors for different depths, velocities and the dominant land use.

Table 1: Guidance on debris factors for different flood depths, velocities and dominant land uses. (Source FD2321 Table 3.1):

Depths (d)	**Pasture/Arable**	**Woodland**	**Urban**
0 to 0.25 m	0	0	0
0.25 to 0.75 m	0	0.5	1
d>0.75 m and\or v>2	0.5	1	1

The way that Flood Hazard Rating and thresholds have been presented in Table 13.1 in FD2320/TR2 compared to Figure 3.2 of FD2321/TR1

A concern was raised in the FD2320 consultation workshops and by the FD2320 Project Board during discussions on FD2321, that the methodology was complex and the results presented in the Figure 3.2 of FD2321 were not reflecting the potential risk to people (as this table was of hazard rating for different depths and velocity without debris). There was a need for further work to include debris, area vulnerability and people vulnerability aspects. They requested a simpler single table to represent the risk to people.

For example Figure 3.2 of FD2321 did not reflect the fact that there is a risk from drowning even at low depths and velocities. In reality FD2321/TR1 recognises this but only in the subsequent "people vulnerability" calculation (risk to children, old, sick and disable). For still water up to 1.25m depth, the Figure 3.2 of FD2321/TR1 assumes that there is low hazard, if there are no debris or vulnerable group. However to avoid further calculation, but include the vulnerability aspect the Table 13.1 of FD2320 for still water with the depths between 0.25–1.25m were reclassified as "danger to some", which was felt to be more appropriate for development planning and control, where users may make use of flood hazard without completing he more complex full calculations including people and area vulnerability.

Similarly Figure 3.2 of FD2321/TR1 shows that at the depth of 0.25m, if there is no debris then up to the flow velocity of 2.0 m/sec there would be low hazard. However FD2321/TR1 suggests the usage of an appropriate debris factor dependent on depth, velocity and the dominant land use. To make the process simpler (whatever the land use), FD2320/TR2 includes a default debris factor. In the Table 13.1 of FD2320/TR2 a debris factor of 0.5 has been applied for depths less than and equal to 0.25m and a debris factor of 1.0 has been used for depths greater than 0.25m. Therefore, in the Table 13.1 of FD2320/TR2 at the depth of 0.25m, up to the flow velocity of 0.30 m/sec is treated as low hazard.

Table 3.2 of FD2321/TR1 (Table 2 of this note) provides thresholds for classifying the hazard to people. In the FD2321/TR1 report the threshold between "danger for most" and "danger for all" is 2.5 and it was used as an initial indication of Risk to People (further calculation is recommended using the formulas). However as there is no further analysis in FD2320 but the Project Board decided that the threshold between "danger for most" and "danger for all" should be more precautionary and a Flood Hazard Rating of 2.0 is selected as a key threshold. i.e. In FD2321 the threshold for "danger for all" is 2.5 and it lowered to 2.0 in FD2320. Therefore, the Flood Hazard Rating between 2.0 to 2.5 in FD2320 is not classified as it is in FD2321.

Table 2: Hazard to People (Source Table 3.2 in FD2321/TR1)

Thresholds for Flood Hazard Rating H = d x (v + 0.5) + DF		**Degree of Flood Hazard**	**Description**
FD2321	**FD2320**		
<0.75	<0.75	Low	**Caution -** "Flood zone with shallow flowing water or deep standing water"
0.75 - 1.25	0.75 - 1.25	Moderate	**Dangerous for some (i.e. children) -** "Danger: Flood zone with deep or fast flowing water"
1.25 - 2.5	1.25 - 2.0	Significant	**Dangerous for most people -** "Danger: flood zone with deep fast flowing water"
>2.5	>2.0	Extreme	**Dangerous for all -** "Extreme danger: flood zone with deep fast flowing water"

The final difference between Table 13.1 in FD2320/TR2 and Figure 3.2 of FD2321/TR1 is the use of smaller increments of depth, so that lower depths are presented more fully in FD2320/TR2. This was felt to be more helpful for identifying what might be judged as acceptable depending on site specific circumstances.

Conclusions

Table 13.1 of FD2320 and Figure 3.2 of FD2321 look very similar but there are significant differences (see Table 3 of this paper). Either Table/Figure can be used as the basis for assessing the risks to people associated with different flood depths velocities and debris factors.

Table 3: comparison of Table 13.1 of FD2320/TR2 and Figure 3.2 of FD2321/TR1

	In Table 13.1 of FD2320/TR2	**In Figure 3.2 of FD2321/TR1**
The depths above 0.25m	Danger for some, most or all	For still water, up to 1.25m the hazard is low (In addition to hazard rating further calculation to include vulnerability aspect is recommended)
Debris factor	Debris factor of 0.5 has been applied for depths $\leq$0.25m and a debris factor of 1.0 has been used for depths $\geq$ 0.25m.	In this case a Debris factor of zero applied (in addition to this further calculation is recommended using debris factor and the formulas)
HR Thresholds for "Dangerous for all" hazard classification	>2.0 (precautionary due to uncertainties and to avoid further calculation as FD2321)	>2.5
Increments of depth	Small increments at lower depths	Every 0.25 m

Table 13.1 of FD2320/TR2 is a simple method applies the precautionary principle and uses suitable assumptions (so that there is no need for further calculations) for application in the development planning and control context (see Table 4 of this paper - an extended version of table 13.1).

This table is recommended for development planning and control use.

Table 4 – Hazard to People Classification using Hazard Rating *(HR= d x (v + 0.5) + DF)* for (Source Table 13.1 of FD2320/TR2 - Extended version)

HR	Depth of flooding - d (m)												
	DF = 0.5				DF = 1								
Velocity - v (m/s)	0.05	0.10	0.20	0.25	0.30	0.40	0.50	0.60	0.80	1.00	1.50	2.00	2.50
0.0	0.03 + 0.5 = 0.53	0.05 + 0.5 = 0.55	0.10 + 0.5 = 0.60	0.13 + 0.5 = 0.63	0.15 + 1.0 = 1.15	0.20 + 1.0 = 1.20	0.25 + 1.0 = 1.25	0.30 + 1.0 = 1.30	0.40 + 1.0 = 1.40	0.50 + 1.0 = 1.50	0.75 + 1.0 = 1.75	1.00 + 1.0 = 2.00	1.25 + 1.0 = 2.25
0.1	0.03 + 0.5 = 0.53	0.06 + 0.5 = 0.56	0.12 + 0.5 = 0.62	0.15 + 0.5 = 0.65	0.18 + 1.0 = 1.18	0.24 + 1.0 = 1.24	0.30 + 1.0 = 1.30	0.36 + 1.0 = 1.36	0.48 + 1.0 = 1.48	0.60 + 1.0 = 1.60	0.90 + 1.0 = 1.90	1.20 + 1.0 = 2.20	1.50 + 1.0 = 2.55
0.3	0.04 + 0.5 = 0.54	0.08 + 0.5 = 0.58	0.15 + 0.5 = 0.65	0.19 + 0.5 = 0.69	0.23 + 1.0 = 1.23	0.30 + 1.0 = 1.30	0.38 + 1.0 = 1.38	0.45 + 1.0 = 1.45	0.60 + 1.0 = 1.60	0.75 + 1.0 = 1.75	1.13 + 1.0 = 2.13	1.50 + 1.0 = 2.50	1.88 + 1.0 = 2.88
0.5	0.05 + 0.5 = 0.55	0.10 + 0.5 = 0.60	0.20 + 0.5 = 0.70	0.25 + 0.5 = 0.75	0.30 + 1.0 = 1.30	0.40 + 1.0 = 1.40	0.50 + 1.0 = 1.50	0.60 + 1.0 = 1.60	0.80 + 1.0 = 1.80	1.00 + 1.0 = 2.00	1.50 + 1.0 = 2.50	2.00 + 1.0 = 3.00	2.50 + 1.0 = 3.50
1.0	0.08 + 0.5 = 0.58	0.15 + 0.5 = 0.65	0.30 + 0.5 = 0.80	0.38 + 0.5 = 0.88	0.45 + 1.0 = 1.45	0.60 + 1.0 = 1.60	0.75 + 1.0 = 1.75	0.90 + 1.0 = 1.90	1.20 + 1.0 = 2.20	1.50 + 1.0 = 2.50	2.25 + 1.0 = 3.25	3.00 + 1.0 = 4.00	3.75 + 1.0 = 4.75
1.5	0.10 + 0.5 = 0.60	0.20 + 0.5 = 0.70	0.40 + 0.5 = 0.90	0.50 + 0.5 = 1.00	0.60 + 1.0 = 1.60	0.80 + 1.0 = 1.80	1.00 + 1.0 = 2.00	1.20 + 1.0 = 2.20	1.60 + 1.0 = 2.60	2.00 + 1.0 = 3.00	3.00 + 1.0 = 4.00	4.00 + 1.0 = 5.00	5.00 + 1.0 = 6.00
2.0	0.13 + 0.5 = 0.63	0.25 + 0.5 = 0.75	0.50 + 0.5 = 1.00	0.63 + 0.5 = 1.13	0.75 + 1.0 = 1.75	1.00 + 1.0 = 2.00	1.25 + 1.0 = 2.25	1.50 + 1.0 = 2.50	2.00 + 1.0 = 3.00	3.50	4.75	6.00	7.25
2.5	0.15 + 0.5 = 0.65	0.30 + 0.5 = 0.80	0.60 + 0.5 = 1.10	0.75 + 0.5 = 1.25	0.90 + 1.0 = 1.90	1.20 + 1.0 = 2.20	1.50 + 1.0 = 2.50	1.80 + 1.0 = 2.80	3.40	4.00	5.50	7.00	8.50
3.0	0.18 + 0.5 = 0.68	0.35 + 0.5 = 0.85	0.70 + 0.5 = 1.20	0.88 + 0.5 = 1.38	1.05 + 1.0 = 2.05	1.40 + 1.0 = 2.40	1.75 + 1.0 = 2.75	3.10	3.80	4.50	6.25	8.00	9.75
3.5	0.20 + 0.5 = 0.70	0.40 + 0.5 = 0.90	0.80 + 0.5 = 1.30	1.00 + 0.5 = 1.50	1.20 + 1.0 = 2.20	1.60 + 1.0 = 2.60	3.00	3.40	4.20	5.00	7.00	9.00	11.00
4.0	0.23 + 0.5 = 0.73	0.45 + 0.5 = 0.95	0.90 + 0.5 = 1.40	1.13 + 0.5 = 1.63	1.35 + 1.0 = 2.35	1.80 + 1.0 = 2.80	3.25	3.70	4.60	5.50	7.75	10.00	12.25
4.5	0.25 + 0.5 = 0.75	0.50 + 0.5 = 1.00	1.00 + 0.5 = 1.50	1.25 + 0.5 = 1.75	1.50 + 1.0 = 2.50	2.00 + 1.0 = 3.00	3.50	4.00	5.00	6.00	8.50	11.00	13.50
5.0	0.28 + 0.5 = 0.78	0.60 + 0.5 = 1.10	1.10 + 0.5 = 1.60	1.38 + 0.5 = 1.88	1.65 + 1.0 = 2.65	3.20	3.75	4.30	5.40	6.50	9.25	12.00	14.75

Flood Hazard Rating (HR)	Colour Code	Hazard to People Classification
Less than 0.75		Very low hazard - Caution
0.75 to 1.25		Danger for some – includes children, the elderly and the infirm
1.25 to 2.0		Danger for most – includes the general public
More than 2.0		Danger for all – includes the emergency services